

## Parallel Diplomacy of Bali and Hainan in A Cultural Economic Perspective

Amanda Jernihati<sup>a,1</sup>, Gilang Nur Alam<sup>b,2</sup>, Windy Dermawan<sup>c,3</sup>

<sup>a,b,c</sup>Padjajaran University, Indonesia

<sup>1</sup>[amanda21005@mail.unpad.ac.id](mailto:amanda21005@mail.unpad.ac.id), 081284729026

<sup>2</sup>[g.n.alam@unpad.ac.id](mailto:g.n.alam@unpad.ac.id), 081113008686

<sup>3</sup>[windy.dermawan@unpad.ac.id](mailto:windy.dermawan@unpad.ac.id), 081927021975

### Abstract

This article investigates the parallelism between the Bali Provincial Government and the Indonesian Central Government in the context of parallel diplomacy through the sister province program between Bali and Hainan Province. This research mainly focuses on the tourism and cultural sectors, analyzed through a cultural economic perspective, where culture is commercialized with certain modifications. However, the Bali Provincial Government, through the Cultural Office, does not prohibit these modifications as long as they adhere to cultural norms and ethics, distinguishing between elements that can be commercialized and those that cannot. This study employs a qualitative method, sourcing data through field studies and literature reviews. The findings indicate harmony and alignment in the relationship between the regional and central governments, reflecting mutually supportive collaboration without significant conflict. The study suggests that this synergy should be continuously strengthened to support the sustainability of cultural diplomacy and cultural economy internationally.

**Keywords:** *Bali, cultural economy, Hainan, parallel diplomacy, sister province*

### 1. Introduction

Diplomatic relations between Indonesia and China have been going on for a long time. Since July 1950, Indonesia has become the first country in Southeast Asia to establish diplomatic relations with China. However, for the first 15 years, the relationship between the two countries was full of suspicion, so diplomatic relations were frozen in 1967. Finally, Indonesia established diplomatic relations with China in 1998 (Sukma, 2009). Seeing that relations between Indonesia and China continue to increase and show positive developments, it is undeniable that cooperation between the two countries brings many benefits. This close bilateral relationship provides economic benefits and strengthens cultural and social relations. With the great potential offered, several regions in Indonesia also carry out parallel diplomacy with China to maximize the benefits that can be obtained. One of the regions that is active in this diplomacy is Bali, which sees great potential in cooperation with China, especially in the tourism and cultural sectors.

One of the regions that has implemented cooperation with China, especially with Hainan Province to become a *sister province*, is Bali Province. *Sister province* or *sister province* is part of parallel diplomacy, a form of non-binding cooperation between sub-national governments in different regions and is carried out to promote cultural and commercial relations (Tavares, 2016). This activity usually invites investment, promotes connectivity and trade, and increases tourist traffic (Chatterji, R., & Saha, S. 2017). The cooperation between the two provinces is intended to achieve their respective interests. Sister province cooperates with one of the provinces in China. In 2017, the Bali Provincial Government agreed to sign a Memorandum of Understanding (MoU) with the Hainan Provincial Government to conduct sister province cooperation to improve welfare and good public services in the fields of (1) Tourism and Culture, (2) Agriculture, (3) Education, (4) Trade, (5) Communication and Informatics (NusaBali, 2023). The activities to establish friendship between the two provinces were carried out by studying the characteristics of each province, one of which was studying their culture. This cooperation aims to encourage sustainable development in the tourism sector by maximizing the potential of local Balinese art to be promoted internationally. On the other hand, Hainan Province sees this

cooperation as an opportunity to develop their tourism area by taking inspiration from Bali's success as a global tourist destination (Pramesti, 2021).

This collaboration not only enhances the promotion of local culture but also creates synergy in sustainable tourism management, providing economic and social benefits for both provinces. The *sister province activities* of both provinces target cultural cooperation, especially in Balinese tourism, both in terms of art processing and its development as a representation of the country's culture. Often, commercialized art is considered to reduce its authenticity and traditional value. However, Bali still holds tightly to the authenticity of its culture by ensuring that every form of art promoted remains rooted in local traditions and heritage. This is a challenge in maintaining a balance between preserving authentic culture and meeting global market demand.

Balinese culture currently plays an important role in the economic activities of its region. Since Bali began developing its tourism through *the Bali Tourist Development Project* (BTDC) in 1970, Bali has become *a pilot project* for developing Indonesian tourism through this, various strategies have been deployed by the local government to continue to advance regional tourism to support the regional economy. This affects the dependence of Bali's economic income on outside parties; the arrival of tourists, especially from abroad, is the mainstay of the Balinese economy (Kresna, 2022).

One of the art forms from Bali to Hainan is bringing traditional dance to Hainan itself. The Bali Provincial Government also presents Balinese Dance in Desa Bali, Hainan Province. Desa Bali was inaugurated in 2018 by Hainan Nanguo Group, Hainan United Airlines Travel Group, and Global International Group (Indonesia) to encourage cooperation between China and Indonesia in the socio-cultural field (Xie, 2020). Desa Bali in Hainan Province is one of the destinations frequently visited by tourists on vacation in Hainan Island, China. Often, many art performances are displayed, and some performances are also directly performed by Indonesian citizens who volunteer to be assigned to enrich the Balinese Cultural experience. The participation of Balinese community artists in actively promoting their cultural identity on the international stage and the involvement of societal actors in this activity are driving forces for Bali's parallel diplomacy activities carried out in Hainan Province to take place.

However, because the Desa Bali tourist attraction in Hainan has a large target of visitors, mostly Chinese citizens, Desa Bali provides an experience for tourists to feel the "soul" of Bali by presenting typical Balinese dances. Many Hoakiau ethnic dancers collaborate with artists from Indonesia, so the dances are not the same as those usually found in Bali. Often, the dances are modified (Safutra, 2019). Bali, which adheres to the Tri Hita Karana philosophy with the preservation of its traditional culture, is being hit by the current of the modern economy. However, the cultural economy is one of the paths chosen by the Province of Bali to boost its economy because there needs to be a cultural foundation in every movement of the Balinese economy so that in carrying out the Balinese economy, it is not separated from its traditional culture, return my Bali to me (Kresna, 2018).

The central government has enacted Undang-Undang Nomor 5 Tahun 2017 concerning the Advancement of Culture, which in Article 7 affirms the government's responsibility to maintain and advance national culture. This law provides a legal basis for efforts to protect and develop local culture throughout Indonesia. However, this raises the question of whether the Bali Provincial Government has similar regulations that align with this law. With its unique and profound cultural richness, Bali is responsible for preserving its cultural heritage. This raises the question of how parallelism between central government and regional government policies can be used to advance culture. Exploring the alignment or differences in these policies can provide insight into the effectiveness of collaboration between the two levels of government in protecting and promoting local culture in the era of globalization.

Understanding parallel diplomacy requires drawing from its grassroots. Diplomacy is a vital activity in national life because it is one of the main means of handling international problems to create world peace. Referring to the understanding by Henry Kissinger (1994), regarding diplomacy itself, it is stated that diplomacy is the art of maintaining complex international relations by considering the balance of power, national interests, and moral values. The state is the leading actor with a greater responsibility to maintain international stability through careful strategy and measured diplomacy (Kissinger, 1994).

During the journey of knowledge about diplomacy developed, diplomacy was transformed in the modern era marked by globalization and new issues such as the environment. According to Henry Kissinger, more flexible diplomacy in facing global challenges is needed to respond to modern conditions (Kissinger, 1994). In several decades, the scope of international relations began to recognize the relationship between domestic and international politics. At that time, there was a phenomenon of increasing involvement of sub-national governments in the international arena (Keating, 1999). According to Duchacek (1988), the development of science and the complexity of political life in the contours of certain countries and the restructuring of territorial politics by eroding some things about the importance of territory within the country with the emergence of new actors and issues (Duchacek, 1988).

Parallel Diplomacy can be identified as diplomacy different from formal diplomacy, the participation of sub-national governments to negotiate with other countries that usually discuss the needs of trade or cultural exchanges (Chatterji & Saha, 2017). The concept of Parallel Diplomacy was introduced by Duchacek (1990) and Panayotis Soldatos (1990), who introduced the concept of parallel diplomacy as foreign relations of sub-state governments in a federal and centralized system, and local governments became increasingly active internationally during the 1970s and 1980s. Keating (1999) stated that parallel diplomacy emerged from globalization and the emergence of transnational regimes that have eroded the distinction between domestic and foreign affairs and simultaneously have changed the division of responsibilities between state and sub-national governments (Keating, 1999).

Some experts say that parallel diplomacy is interpreted as a layered term divided into 4 phenomena: (1) Ceremonial, (2) Single-themed, (3) Global, and (4) Sovereignty. As one of the phenomena that is part of parallel diplomacy, Ceremonial Paradiplomacy is a form of image formation carried out by subnational or regional governments to carry out their foreign relations. This image forms the formation of twin towns or sister states agreements, which are a form of non-binding cooperation arrangements made between subnational governments in different geographical and political areas to promote cultural and commercial relations (Tavares, 2016). Based on these cultural and commercial relations, the sister city or sister province *scheme* ultimately works together to take economic advantage through culture and education. Subnational governments often use the concept of a sister city or sister province as part of parallel diplomacy activities. In this approach, the main focus of sister city or sister province cooperation includes education and political aspects, emphasizing cultural awareness and exchange. This shows that the sister province is an effort by the government at the subnational level to establish international relations. (Alam, GN, & Sudirman, A., 2020).

To see parallel diplomacy activities in more depth, there are three types of motivations for regions to conduct parallel diplomacy based on, namely economic, sub-national governments to attract foreign investment, promote trade, and improve economic relations with international actors, then cultural, namely sub-national governments that have their cultural characteristics can establish foreign relations to promote, preserve, or hold cultural and educational exchanges, and political to seek legitimacy and recognition in the international arena (Aldecoa, F. & Keating, M., 2013).

Understanding parallel diplomacy by looking at local governments in foreign relations activities must be seen from its relationship with the central government. Referring to the parallel aspect of parallel diplomacy, there is a pattern of relations formed from the relationship between the central and regional governments. Local governments, such as provinces or regional areas, play a role in foreign relations in a way that is in concert *with*, parallel, or even in conflict *with* the central government's foreign policy (*Criekemans, 2010*).

In line with the evolution and over time, the cultural economy was created and developed from recognizing that cultural factors can play an essential role in economic activity. The term 'Cultural Economy' comes from the idea of 'Cultural Industry,' which is the reproduction of the economy in the form of culture. The cultural industry includes performing arts, television, radio, cinema, newspapers, magazines and book publishing, the recording industry and music publishing, and advertising. This term draws attention to the expansion of related activities under the umbrella of 'culture,' both state-supported and commercial. Recognizing the importance of social and economic interests and paying attention to political interests, the cultural industry has become a

topic of policy attention. However, this is separate from the traditional focus on cultural policy. In most cases, the cultural industry is the responsibility of business and industry departments, and culture is the responsibility of heritage (Pratt, 2014).

In addition, some countries use the term 'cultural and creative industries' because it allows countries with a very strong public tradition of funding high arts to talk about commercial culture at the same time. The narrowing of the 'creative' modifier has been a source of concern that it potentially focuses on an idealistic version of 'creativity', which is at odds with the social processes of cultural reproduction. The term cultural industries concept emerged from the writings of two philosophers from the *Frankfurt School of Critical Theory* who highlighted the cultural industries as an instrument of capitalism to maintain social domination and control, Theodor Adorno and Max Horkheimer (Hesmondhalgh, 2013). More recently, policymakers have adopted the term 'cultural economy' to avoid being reduced to 'creativity' and foregrounding the socially situated constitution of 'culture' (Pratt, 2014).

The dimensions of the cultural economy are still under development. There are no restrictions on the discussion features. Still, there are 5 suggestions given for the discussion limits whether it can be categorized as part of the cultural economy, including (1) Religion, which is the most basic and initial form of culture in human life as a maker and disseminator of texts, in addition, there are symbols that distinguish between existing religions. (2) Sports, recreation, and entertainment is included because it is considered to have several similarities because both often require subsidies for facilities such as stadiums and performing arts complexes, (3) Education is included because of the function of art educators as one of the parties involved in cultural workers and can introduce aspects of culture itself, (4) Information, in this case, there is a provision of informative cultural product presentations and is equated with certain cultural aspects, (5) Supplier and Distributor Sector, cultural economy actors certainly need supporting factors that are following the supply chain for sustainability needs, the emergence of the need for suppliers is influenced by cultural aspects (Markusen, Wassall, DeNatale, & Cohen, 2006).

Markusen (2008) finally explained that the definition of cultural economy could be called the process of economic mixing with the increase in the added value of an economic product by utilizing certain cultural features. This cultural economy is considered a prominent business carried out by cultural and economic actors that carry out cultural activities following general demand and competition in the cultural industry (Hesmondhalgh, 2013). This allows for modifications to the community's local culture, which becomes a means for cultural and economic activities to follow market desires so that culture can be traded. Often, this activity puts aside the original cultural values.

The author uses previous research to find a gap and see the novelty of this research compared to previous research. Relevant research was conducted by Intentilia and Putra (2021). in an article entitled "From Local to Global: Examining Sister City Cooperation as Paradiplomacy Practice in Denpasar City, Bali, Indonesia." This article highlights the practice of parallel diplomacy through sister city cooperation in Denpasar, Bali, Indonesia, with a multidisciplinary approach from the study of Law and International Relations. The main focus is on how Denpasar carries out parallel diplomacy through sister-city cooperation to build international relations and the legal and social challenges it faces. The article provides an overview of the potential and obstacles in managing international cooperation at the regional level through parallel diplomacy. The relevance to the research currently being conducted is the discussion of parallel diplomacy carried out by the Bali regional government through the city of Denpasar, with the novelty that the author of this research will raise is that this research will be based on the parallel diplomacy activities of Bali Province with Hainan Province, China. This research will highlight the parallels of parallel diplomacy by local governments with diplomacy by the central government by looking at it from a cultural and economic perspective.

The position of this article seeks to investigate the parallel aspects between the policies implemented by the Bali Provincial Government and the Central Government of Indonesia, especially regarding the preservation and advancement of culture through the cultural economy. Therefore, this article will be based on the theory of parallel diplomacy and cultural economy. Through parallel diplomacy activities carried out through *sister province cooperation* with Hainan Province, China, the two provinces seek to develop the tourism and arts sectors as part of

the cultural economy. This article aims to understand how the Bali Government and the Central Government can synergize in preserving the authenticity of Balinese culture while utilizing the potential of this culture to improve the regional economy. Thus, this article fills the gap in previous studies regarding the parallel aspects between central and regional government policies in the advancement of culture and the cultural economy.

## 2. Method

The research method used for this article is a qualitative method guided by the writing according to Christopher Lamont, who created guidelines in his book "Research Methods in International Relations." Quoting Lamont, qualitative methods are data collection methods and analysis strategies that rely on non-numerical data from social artifacts such as text, verbal and visual forms of communication, and interpretations of social phenomena or events (Lamont, 2022). The author chose the qualitative method in this article because it allows the author to study the data collected in more depth and then interpret and draw conclusions in response to the article. This is also because the researcher does not measure how strong or weak the parallelism aspect is between the central and regional governments but instead focuses on exploring how the parallelism aspect is reflected in the *sister province cooperation* between Bali and Hainan as a form of paradiplomacy by the Bali provincial government.

The data sources in this article will be obtained by collecting both primary and secondary data. Primary data is obtained from interviews with subnational actors involved in implementing Bali Parallel Diplomacy and official Balinese government documents related to Balinese traditional dance arts. Secondary data sources are obtained from various literature, such as journals and books related to Bali Parallel Diplomacy, Cultural Economy, and Culture, and news relevant to the article. The first data collection technique is the interview technique. In addition to interviews, articles based on archives or documents serve as the backbone of qualitative International Relations studies. Both of these article bases can help this article, which is relevant to the object, namely parallel diplomacy, using this research with official documents, books, and relevant journal articles (Lamont, 2022).

This article uses *content analysis* as the analysis technique. The scope of the analysis determined is Bali Parallel Diplomacy. After determining the scope, a categorization is carried out, which can be carried out deductively or inductively. Data triangulation or intra-method triangulation will be carried out to strengthen the validity of the data. Data triangulation is done by comparing data obtained from at least three sources to verify the data (Lamont, 2022).

## 3. Result and Discussion

### Results

The cooperation agreement carried out by the Province of Bali and Hainan Province is one of the activities that attempts to obtain the interests of each province, and this can also promote their respective regions. The parallel diplomacy activities by the two provinces are carried out while still paying attention to applicable laws. This activity is in line with the Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 25 of 2020 concerning Procedures for Regional Cooperation with Regional Governments Abroad and Regional Cooperation with Institutions Abroad Article 4, which explains various objects of cooperation, including cultural exchange and promotion of regional potential. In addition, following the Regulation of the Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 3 of 2019 concerning General Guidelines for Foreign Relations by Regional Governments.

Initially, the Bali Provincial Government, together with the Hainan Provincial Government as members of the *Inter-island Tourism Policy Forum* (ITOP Forum) in 1997 had promoted cooperation; since the meeting, the two provincial governments have visited each other to exchange information on the development and development of their respective tourism growth rates. Based on the cooperation matrix of the Indonesian *sister province* with the ASTIMPAS country partner, in early 2011, the two provinces signed a *Letter of Intent* (LOI) on October 20, 2011, carried out by the two governors. This LOI was enhanced by implementing a Memorandum

of Understanding signed on July 27, 2017. This is the formation of a 5-year cooperation until 2022. This memorandum of understanding mentions expanding cooperation covering arts and culture, tourism, agriculture, trade, economy and infrastructure, and education (Sendra, 2023).

According to the Bali Provincial Government, Bali's success in developing tourism activities Hainan Province took an approach to be able to learn more from Bali Province. The following is an excerpt from an interview with the Head of the Foreign Cooperation Team of the Government and People's Welfare Bureau of the Bali Provincial Secretariat, Ni Putu Susi Lestari, S.IP., MAP:

*"This (sister province) started when both provinces participated in the ITOP Forum, then Hainan Province offered cooperation to Bali Province to carry out an MoU for 5 years from 2017 to 2022; Hainan Province saw that Bali Province was greatly developing its cultural characteristics for tourism activities. Therefore, cooperation was formed between the two provinces by visiting each other, and Hainan Province provided scholarships for Balinese students to study for 5 years at Hainan Province College. Currently, we are still in the process of extending the cooperation again" – Ni Putu Susi Lestari, S.IP., MAP, Bureau of Government and Public Welfare, Bali Provincial Secretariat.*

The activities of the Bali-Hainan *sister province* have been known to have started since the formation of the ITOP Forum in 1997. This was obtained from an interview with Mrs. Ni Putu Susi Lestari, S.IP., MAP, Bureau of Government and Public Welfare, Bali Provincial Secretariat, and a book by I Made Sendra.

Table 1.

Year	Month	Activities carried out
1995	October	- Working level representative meeting between Bali Provincial Government and Hainan Province - Agreement on the establishment of the East Asia Islands Tourism Policy Forum
1997	July	<i>(Inter-Island Tourism Policy)</i> The forum was initiated by Bali (Indonesia), Hainan (China), Okinawa (Japan), and Jeju (South Korea).
2011	October	Enhancement of <i>the Letter of Intent</i> (LOI) through the signing of a Memorandum of Understanding between Hainan Province and Bali Province for tourism development.
2012	June	The head of the Hainan Provincial Tourism Office, Chen Yao, visited the Governor of Bali, Made Mangku Pastika, to carry out cooperation in the tourism sector for the development of <i>Meetings, Incentives, Conventions, and Exhibitions</i> (MICE) tourism.
2013	October	The visit of Hainan Deputy Governor Chen Zhi Rong to Bali Governor Made Mangku Pastika aimed to establish cooperation in the fields of economy, agriculture, culture, education, and tourism.
	December	Hainan Deputy Governor Chen Zhi Rong invited the Governor of Bali to attend the agricultural products expo.
2014	January	Hainan Airlines Beijing-Denpasar Flight Inauguration.
2015	August	Ratification of the MoU on 20 October 2011 with a visit by the Secretary of the Communist Party of Hainan Province, Luo Baoming, to the Governor of Bali Made Mangku Pastika.
2016	July	Hainan Province participated in the 38th Bali Arts Festival (PKB).

		- Hainan Province provides scholarships for 50 Balinese students for 5 (five) years to study at several universities in Hainan Province.
		- Development of Desa Bali by private company Nan Kuo.
2017	September	- <i>charter</i> flights to Hainan's capital, Haikou. Jakarta-Haikou. - <i>charter</i> flight routes to major cities in China, one of which is Sanya (Hainan).
2018	March	Dance representatives from the Balinese and Hainan communities for a dance performance at <i>the Chinese Tourism Training Center (CTTC)</i> of Udayana University in collaboration with the Consul General of the People's Republic of China in Denpasar for the cultural performance "Chinese Arts Enters Indonesian Campus".
		- The inauguration of Desa Bali by Hainan Nanguo Group, Hainan United Airlines Travel Group, and Global International Group (Indonesia) aimed to promote cooperation between China and Indonesia in the socio-cultural field.
2019	April	Sanggar Seni Santhi Budaya from Bali participated in representing Indonesia in <i>the 36th Weifang International Kite Festival and the 4th Spring of International Folk Art</i> .
2020	April	In assistance to combat the spread of the COVID-19 virus, 50,000 masks were donated by Hainan Province to Bali Province

Source: Interview results with Mrs. Ni Putu Susi Lestari, S.IP., MAP, Bureau of Government and Public Welfare, Bali Provincial Secretariat, December 11, 2024, & Sendra, IM (2023). Cultural Diplomacy Tourism. Larasan Library: Denpasar.

The chronology above indicates that the cooperation between the Bali Provincial Government and the Hainan Provincial Government has been established for a long time, starting from 1995 until now. During this period, parallel diplomatic relations in the form of *sister provinces* were dominated by official visits, cultural exchanges, and assistance in education and health. This cooperation proves that the two provinces have similarities in tourism and culture, a strong basis for ongoing collaboration. This is a direct example of the benefits of *sister provinces*, where the relationship between Bali and Hainan allows the two provinces to strengthen cooperation in various fields. The cultural exchanges enrich each other's cultural heritage and strengthen mutual understanding between the people of the two provinces.

The characteristic of Balinese culture is 'Tri Hita Karana', which are three elements of building balance and harmony in the relationship between humans and God, humans and humans, and humans and their environment. This concept explores living side by side, full of tolerance, with each other. This is because the concept of Tri Hita Karana can also be interpreted as three causes of prosperity. This can be interpreted as the fact that the Balinese people who live side by side also maintain the sustainability of their culture and environment (Tim Mimbar Hindu, 2022). Seeing this uniqueness, many Balinese cultures have been 'brought' to Hainan Province to be displayed, for example, the performance of Balinese dance in Desa Bali, Hainan. Desa Bali was inaugurated in 2018 by Hainan Nanguo Group, Hainan United Airlines Travel Group, and Global International Group (Indonesia) to encourage cooperation between China and Indonesia in the socio-cultural field (Xie, 2020).

### Discussion

Desa Bali in Hainan Province is one of the destinations frequently visited by tourists on vacation in Hainan Island, China. Many art performances are displayed, and some performances are also directly performed by Indonesian citizens who volunteer to be assigned to enrich the Balinese Cultural experience. The participation of Balinese community artists actively promoting their cultural identity on the international stage and the involvement of societal actors in this

activity is a driving force for Bali's parallel diplomacy activities carried out in Hainan Province to take place. This is also because the Balinese people strongly maintain the sacredness and integrity of the culture of their ancestral Hindu religion. This results in many works of art created from a combination of strong Hindu elements and customs adopted by each community in Bali.

However, because the Desa Bali tourist attraction in Hainan has a large target of visitors, mostly Chinese citizens themselves, Desa Bali provides an experience for tourists to feel the "soul" of Bali by presenting typical Balinese dances. Many Hoakiau ethnic dancers collaborate with artists from Indonesia, so the dances are not the same as those usually found in Bali. Often, the dances are modified (Safutra, 2019). Based on the dance activists themselves, it was stated that modifications were often made for several performances. The intention of the changes was also to remove several parts of the dance used for traditional activities. A dance activist from Ubud, Pandu, explained how the modification of dance for the needs of the performance took place:

*"For dances performed by the public, often to keep up with the times, we re-develop the dances by eliminating some dances that we consider sacred for traditional ceremonies."*  
- Pandu, Member of Sekehe Gong Panca Artha.

Balinese culture that has been modified for the sake of commercializing tourism has raised concerns because it is considered inconsistent with the principles of Tri Hita Karana, which emphasizes harmony between humans, nature, and God. Such practices risk reducing the values of native culture for economic gain, which has the potential to damage the essence and integrity of Balinese culture. In terms of regulation, the central government, through Law Number 5 of 2017 concerning the Advancement of Culture, especially Article 7, emphasizes the importance of mainstreaming culture in every aspect of development to advance culture. Furthermore, Article 4 states that the central government must collaborate with local governments in this effort. Thus, there is a clear mandate that local governments, including the Bali Provincial Government, should be actively involved in maintaining and advancing local culture in accordance with national policies.

To understand whether the Bali Provincial Government has implemented the policy in harmony, an in-depth analysis is needed regarding the parallelism aspect between central and regional policies. This analysis can be done based on Criekekmans' theory, which discusses the relationship between the center and sub-national so that it can be known to what extent the collaboration and harmonization between central and regional policies are advancing authentic Balinese culture. Criekekmans believes that every thought regarding parallel diplomacy by sub-states acting in concert with, parallel, or even in conflict with the central government's foreign policy (Criekekmans, 2010).

Bali Province, which has collaborated with Hainan Province, often sends delegations of its sons and daughters to showcase their culture. The Bali Provincial Cultural Office also knows that often, for the sake of the performances presented to guests, artists bring Balinese culture by 'modifying' or 'improvising' the performances to suit their needs. Some of these modified cultures are indeed intended to support Bali's cultural economy. This is allowed because the Bali Provincial Government cannot restrict the freedom of creativity of artists and cultural figures. The government also encourages the public to actively and wisely choose and sort out which can be presented commercially and which cannot. To overcome this problem, the Bali Cultural Council (MKB), which is an institution that maintains the authenticity of Balinese culture, is established in Bali. The following is an excerpt from an interview with the Bali Cultural Office, I Ketut Agus Adi Kamajaya, SS, M. Hum:

*"If we talk about cultural economy, there are several performances that are divided. Performances specifically for entertainment support the cultural economy because they are presented to guests. The Cultural Office cannot restrict the freedom of creativity of artists and cultural figures, but we encourage the public to be active and wise. They should be able to choose and sort out which can be presented for commercial purposes and which cannot. We also have a Cultural Council, an institution that specifically thinks about how Balinese Culture will be in the future" - I Ketut Agus Adi Kamajaya, SS, M. Hum, Bali Cultural Office.*



In addition, in implementing parallel diplomacy with Hainan Province using culture, the Bali Provincial Government also includes the community's role in following the central government's needs and directions. This aligns with Undang-Undang Nomor 5 Tahun 2017 concerning the Advancement of Culture, especially in Article 7, which emphasizes the importance of mainstreaming culture in every development aspect to advance culture. Furthermore, Article 4 states that the central government must collaborate with local governments in this effort. In this context, Bali has Regional Regulation Number 5 of 2020 concerning the Standards for the Implementation of Balinese Cultural Tourism, which explains the strengthening and advancement of Balinese Culture, which places culture as the core of Bali's development. Not only is Bali advancing, but it also adds aspects of strengthening culture, which means recognizing and maintaining the natural and traditional strengths that exist in Bali. This synergy shows that the flow of advancing and strengthening culture at the regional level is in line with national policies, ensuring that cultural development goes hand in hand at all levels of government, as based on a quote from a follow-up interview with the Bali Cultural Service, I Ketut Agus Adi Kamajaya, SS, M. Hum:

*"The Province of Bali also has a law related to Undang-Undang Nomor 5 Tahun 2017 concerning the Advancement of Culture. The Bali Provincial Government adopted the law and in line with the Bali Provincial Regulation Number 5 of 2020 concerning the Standards for Organizing Balinese Cultural Tourism, the Bali Provincial Government strengthens culture by adding strengthening elements in addition to advancement, which do not only focus on advancement like in other places. This strengthening means recognizing and maintaining the real strengths that exist in Bali, both physically and non-physically. In this effort, Bali continues to synergize with the central government to ensure that the flow of advancement and strengthening of culture at the regional level runs in line with policies at the national level so that both can run together in one breath of cultural development." - I Ketut Agus Adi Kamajaya, SS, M. Hum, Bali Cultural Office.*

Based on the statement from the Bali Provincial Cultural Service, it can be analyzed the parallel aspects of the parallel diplomacy activities carried out by Bali, based on Crikemans' theory, parallel diplomacy activities by Bali Province with Hainan Province in cultural activities by analyzing policies and activities directly can be analyzed in 3 actions; (1) running together (*concert with*), (2) parallel (*parallel*), or even (3) intersecting (*conflicting*).

In terms of policy and activities carried out directly, these parallel diplomacy activities follow applicable regulations. Based on the Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 25 of 2020 concerning Procedures for Regional Cooperation with Regional Governments Abroad and Regional Cooperation with Institutions Abroad, Article 4, which explains various objects of cooperation, one of which is cultural exchange and promotion of regional potential, this is following the parallel diplomacy activities of the Province of Bali with the Province of Hainan which collaborate in tourism and cultural activities to be able to promote each region and achieve their respective interests. In addition, Undang-Undang Nomor 5 Tahun 2017 concerning the Advancement of Culture, especially Article 7, emphasizes the importance of mainstreaming culture in every aspect of development to advance culture, this is in line with the existence of the Regional Regulation of the Province of Bali Number 5 of 2020 concerning the Standards for Organizing Balinese Cultural Tourism which also strengthens the elements of advancement. Article 4, concerning collaboration between regional and central governments, is also carried out jointly by the Provincial Government of Bali and the Central Government.

In the activity, 2 (two) aspects can be found that can be taken from Crikemans' theory there are aspects (1) running together (*concert with*) and (2) parallel (*parallel*). This does not find any aspects of conflict (*conflicting*). This finding shows that through parallel diplomacy activities between the Bali Provincial Government and the Hainan Provincial Government in the context of a *sister province* in the perspective of cultural economy, aspects of parallelism were found from the regional government (Bali Provincial Government) with the central government (Indonesian Government) in their activities that are in line with existing policies. This finding underlines the importance of synergy between regional governments and the central government in carrying out parallel diplomacy that is in line with national policies. In the context of a *sister province*

between the Bali Provincial Government and the Hainan Provincial Government, this collaboration strengthens international relations. It supports the development of a sustainable cultural economy. With no aspects of conflict, this relationship confirms that harmonious and parallel cooperation can encourage mutual progress while strengthening Bali's role in cultural diplomacy that aligns with Indonesia's national goals.

#### 4. Conclusion

Parallel diplomacy activities in the form of *sister provinces* between the Bali Provincial Government and the Hainan Provincial Government are a form of mutually beneficial cooperation. Both provinces have the same interests, namely for the development of sustainable tourism and culture. With the background of the ITOP Forum which covers the two provinces, which was carried out by the two provinces, several visits and meetings were carried out to discuss the second cooperation, ultimately creating parallel diplomacy cooperation in the form of *sister provinces* based on the Improvement of the *Letter of Intent* (LOI) through the signing of a Memorandum of Understanding on October 20, 2011, by Hainan Province with Bali Province for tourism development. This parallel diplomacy activity is also based on the Regulation of the Minister of Home Affairs Number 25 of 2020 concerning Procedures for Regional Cooperation with Regional Governments Abroad and Regional Cooperation with Institutions Abroad Article 4 and by the Regulation of the Minister of Foreign Affairs of the Republic of Indonesia Number 3 of 2019 concerning General Guidelines for Foreign Relations by Regional Governments.

The use of culture is one of the drivers of each provincial economy. Therefore, the two provinces learn from each other regarding their respective regions. The culture here is often commercialized by being modified and is considered to reduce its authenticity and traditional value. The Bali Provincial Government does not rule out such modifications and invites artists to continue their creativity, which must remain based on norms. It must also be able to sort out which art can be commercialized and which cannot. In line with central government regulations, the Bali Provincial Government has Regional Regulation Number 5 of 2020 concerning the Standards for Organizing Balinese Cultural Tourism, which contains an explanation regarding the strengthening and advancement of Balinese Culture. This shows that the parallel diplomacy activities of the Province of Bali and Hainan Province it show aspects of parallelism with the central government based on Crikemans' theory.

#### 5. Recommendation

As a follow-up to the results of this study, it is essential for the Bali Provincial Government to continue to maintain a balance between cultural preservation and economic development through tourism. Strengthening more specific regulations regarding restrictions and supervision of cultural commercialization also needs to be considered so that Balinese culture remains authentic while providing space for the creativity of artists. In addition, more intense coordination between the central and regional governments is also expected to strengthen the synergy of existing parallel diplomacy, especially in facing the challenges of globalization that affect the development of local culture and economy. The Bali Provincial Government can expand its cooperation network with other provinces with similar potential to increase the competitiveness of Indonesian tourism and culture in the international market.

#### 6. Referensi

- Alam, G. N., & Sudirman, A. (2020). Paradiplomacy Pemerintah Kota Bandung Melalui Kerja Sama Sister City. *Jurnal Ilmiah Hubungan Internasional*, 16(1), 31-50. <https://doi.org/10.26593/jihi.v16i1.3365.31-50>
- Aldecoa, F. & Keating, M. (Eds.). (2013). *Paradiplomacy in Action: The Foreign Relations of Subnational Governments*. New York: Routledge.
- Chatterji, R., & Saha, S. (2017). *Para-diplomacy: Concept and the Context*. SAGE Publications, 73(4), 1-20. <https://doi.org/10.1177/0974928417731638>

- Criekemans, D. (2010). *Regional Sub-State Diplomacy Today*. IDC Publisher: Netherlands
- Duchacek, I. D. (1988). Multicommunal and bicommunal polities and their international relations. Dalam D. Duchacek, D. Latouche, & G. Stevenson (Eds.), *Perforated sovereignties and international relations: Trans-sovereign contacts of subnational governments* (pp. 3–28). Greenwood Press.
- Hesmondhalgh, D. (2013). *The Cultural Industries*. SAGE Publications.
- Intentilia, A. A.M. & Putra, A. A. B. N. A. S. (2021). From Local to Global: Examining Sister City Cooperation as Paradiplomacy in Denpasar City, Bali, Indonesia. *Jurnal Bina Praja*, Vol.13 No.2. <https://doi.org/10.21787/jbp.13.2021.357-367>.
- ITOP. (n.d.). History of ITOP. Retrieved from <https://www.itop-forum.org/index.php/contents/about/history>.
- Keating, M. (1999). Regions and International Affairs: Motives, Opportunities and Strategies. *Regional and Federal Studies*, 9(1), 1-16, DOI: 10.1080/13597569908421068
- Kementerian Luar Negeri Republik Indonesia. (2021). Matriks Kerja Sama Sister Province Indonesia dengan Mitra Negara ASTIMPAS Per 10 Oktober 2021. Retrieved from <https://pug.kemlu.go.id/produks/20231102094032-Produk%20PUG.pdf>
- Kissinger, H. (1994). *Diplomacy*. Simon & Schuster: New York
- Kresna, D. G. P. A. (2018). Meneguhkan Ekonomi Kebudayaan Bali. *BaliPost*. [https://www.balipost.com/news/2018/09/26/56709/Meneguhkan-Ekonomi-Kebudayaan-Bali.html#google\\_vignette](https://www.balipost.com/news/2018/09/26/56709/Meneguhkan-Ekonomi-Kebudayaan-Bali.html#google_vignette)
- Kresna, D. G. P. A. (2022). Ekonomi Kebudayaan Bali. *BaliPost*. [https://www.balipost.com/news/2022/07/20/281064/Ekonomi-Kebudayaan-Bali.html#google\\_vignette](https://www.balipost.com/news/2022/07/20/281064/Ekonomi-Kebudayaan-Bali.html#google_vignette)
- Lamont, C. (2022). *Research Methods in International Relations* (A. Malvern (ed.); 2nd ed.). London: SAGE Publications.
- Markusen, Ann & Director, & Wassall, Gregory & Coordinator, Graduate & DeNatale, Doug. (2006). Defining the Cultural Economy: Industry and Occupational Approaches. Retrieved from [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/228659572\\_Defining\\_the\\_Cultural\\_Economy\\_Industry\\_and\\_Occupational\\_Approaches/references](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/228659572_Defining_the_Cultural_Economy_Industry_and_Occupational_Approaches/references)
- Pramesti, A. L. (2021). Paradiplomacy of the Provincial Government of Bali for Sister Province of Bali with Hainan Province. [https://www.researchgate.net/publication/357151492\\_Paradiplomacy\\_of\\_the\\_Provincial\\_Government\\_of\\_Bali\\_for\\_Sister\\_Province\\_of\\_Bali\\_with\\_Hainan\\_Province\\_Paradiplomasi\\_Pemerintah\\_Provinsi\\_Bali\\_untuk\\_Sister\\_Province\\_Bali\\_dengan\\_Provinsi\\_Hainan](https://www.researchgate.net/publication/357151492_Paradiplomacy_of_the_Provincial_Government_of_Bali_for_Sister_Province_of_Bali_with_Hainan_Province_Paradiplomasi_Pemerintah_Provinsi_Bali_untuk_Sister_Province_Bali_dengan_Provinsi_Hainan).
- Pratt, A. C. (2014). Cultural Economy. Dalam Richardson, D. (Ed.), *The International Encyclopedia of Geography: People, the Earth, Environment, and Technology*. DOI: 10.1002/9781118786352.
- Sendra, I. M. (2023). *Pariwisata Diplomasi Budaya*. Pustaka Larasan: Denpasar
- Sukma, R. (2009). Indonesia-China Relations: The Politics of Re-engagement. *Asian Survey*, 49(4), 591-608. <https://doi.org/10.1525/as.2009.49.4.591>
- Tavares, R. (2016). *PARADIPLOMACY: Cities and States as Global Players*. USA: Oxford University Press.
- Xie, A. (2020). 'Desa Bali' di Hainan, Jembatan Persahabatan China-Indonesia. *detikNews*.